



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/554,984	05/23/2000	Daniel H. Maes	2870/287	1797

<sup>7590</sup>  
KAREN A. LOWNY, ESQ.  
ESTEE LAUDER COMPANIES  
125 PINELAWN ROAD  
MELVILLE, NY 11747

01/29/2007

EXAMINER

PRYOR, ALTON NATHANIEL

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
	1616

1616

SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD OF RESPONSE	MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
3 MONTHS	01/29/2007	PAPER

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire 6 MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.

# Office Action Summary

Application No.	Applicant(s)	
09/554,984	MAES ET AL	
Examiner	Art Unit	
Alton N. Pryor	1616	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

## Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

## Status

- 1)  Responsive to communication(s) filed on 10/5/06;11/16/06.
- 2a)  This action is **FINAL**.                      2b)  This action is non-final.
- 3)  Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

## Disposition of Claims

- 4)  Claim(s) 2,4,6,8-13,15-26,28-33,35 and 36 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5)  Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6)  Claim(s) 2,4,6,8-13,15-26,28-33,35, and 36 is/are rejected.
- 7)  Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8)  Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

## Application Papers

- 9)  The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10)  The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a)  accepted or b)  objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11)  The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

## Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12)  Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a)  All    b)  Some \*    c)  None of:
- Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  - Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  - Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

## Attachment(s)

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)                                | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)<br>Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)                       | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application                       |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)<br>Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____  |

Art Unit: 1616

### DETAILED ACTION

I. Applicant argues that Simon does not make obvious specific combination of ingredients, i.e. a composition comprising 0.1 to 10% actives selected from Asiatic acid, dihydroxacetone, essential oils, essential fatty acids and vitamin D derivatives.

Examiner disagrees with Applicant since the ingredients of the composition are common to the cosmetic art. See argument below. Applicant makes mention of unexpected results for the instant invention on page 9 lines 23-34 and page 10 lines 1-8. However, the statement is not accompanied with actual data for the claimed invention.

#### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103***

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 2,4,6,8-13,15-26,28-33,35, and 36 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Simon et al (USPN 5932234), Bissett et al (USPN 6183761), Elias et al (USPN 5885565) and Subbiah (USPN 6150381). Simon teaches a skin care composition comprising a cosmetic and / or dermatological active agent for treating a variety of skin conditions such as aging and acne. Simon teaches that the active comprises 0.1 to 10% of the skin care composition and can be selected from a number of ingredients including Asiatic acid, dihydroxacetone, essential oils, essential fatty acids and vitamin D derivatives. See column 5 line 49 – column 5 line 38. Simon suggests that the composition can comprise of one or more actives. See column 5 lines

Art Unit: 1616

49 – 65. Note Simon is open to the inclusion of many more actives since Simon recites in column 5 lines 66-67 “Among the actives which may be used in the present invention, mention may be, for example of:” The phrase “may be, for example” allows for the addition of other actives besides those mentioned in the specification to his composition / process. Simon also teaches that other ingredients such as sunscreens can be added to the skin care composition. See column 5 lines 44-48. Simon teaches a method of applying the composition to the skin in order to treat skin related disorders such as aging and acne. Simon does not teach the invention comprising 1) betunlinic acid or boswellic acid, 2) cholesteryl sulfate, and 3) sclareolide.

Bissett teaches a skin care or skin regulating composition comprising betunlinic acid or boswellic acid. See abstract, claim 1. Bissett teaches a method of applying the composition to the skin in order to treat aging, dry skin, and skin conditions cause by microorganisms (acne). See column 3 line 26 – column 5 line 21. It would have been obvious to one having ordinary skill in the art to modify the invention of Simon to include boswellic acid or betunlinic acid. One would have been motivated to do this since Simon allows for the inclusion of other compounds (actives) in his invention. Additionally, one would have been motivated to do this because boswellic acid and betunlinic acid are used extensively in the skin care / cosmetic art. The modified Simon-Bissett invention does not include sclareolide.

Subbiah teaches a skin care or cosmetic composition comprising sclareolide. See abstract, claim 1. Subbiah teaches a method of applying the composition to the skin to treat a skin condition such as acne. See column 2 line 55 - column 3 line 41. It

Art Unit: 1616

would have been obvious to one having ordinary skill in the art to modify the invention of Simon-Bissett to include sclareolide. One would have been motivated to do this since Simon allows for the inclusion of other compounds (actives) in his invention. Additionally, one would have been motivated to do this because sclareolide is used extensively skin care / cosmetic art. The modified Simon-Bissett-Subbiah invention does not include cholesterol sulfate.

Elias teaches a method of enhancing the penetration of an active into the skin using a sterol such as cholesterol sterol. See abstract. Elias teaches a method of combining the sterol with an active and then applying the combination to the skin. See claim 1. The cholesterol sterol, which is hydrophobic, enhances the transport of the active compound through the skin. One having ordinary skill in the art would have been expected to modify the combined invention of Simon-Bissett-Subbiah to include cholesterol sulfate. One would have been motivated to do this in order to make an invention with enhanced permeability of the actives through the skin.

#### ***Telephonic Inquiry***

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Alton N. Pryor whose telephone number is 571-272-0621. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00 a.m. - 4:30 p.m..

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Johann Richter can be reached on 571-272-0646. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Art Unit: 1616

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.



Alton Pryor  
Primary Examiner  
AU 1616